Framework for TBL Application Activity Reporting Facilitation

Loretta Whitehorne Registered Nurses Professional Development Center Larry Michaelsen Central Missouri University Jim Sibley University of British Columbia

Discovery	**Gather and Explore Ideas**	**Honor** Respecting and actively listening to each person's contribution. 	**Mark** Directing attention to someone else's contribution. 	**Paraphrase** Concise restatement of previous comment. 	**Summarize** Restating the aggregated ideas of previous speakers. 	**Devil's Advocate** Examining alternate choices when uniform consensus exists.
	Extend and Develop Ideas	**Unpack** Explaining in detail how a team arrived at a decision. 	**Build** Adding to statement of previous speaker. 	**Elaborate** Adding supporting and non-supporting facts and rationales. 	**Link/Combine** Put ideas together. Articulating links between ideas Incorporating multiple sources into a single idea. 	**Respond to Questions with Questions** Redirecting student questions away from instructor.
Examination	**Compare and Validate Ideas**	**Defend/Challenge** Defending your reasoning and challenging the reasoning of others. **Compare/Contrast** Examining rationales to articulate similarities and differences.	**Assumptions** Uncovering what is believed to be true without proof? **Complications** Uncovering difficulties with rationales or ideas. 	**Clarify** Explaining in greater clarity or detail. **Simplify** Explaining by eliminating extraneous detail. 	**Support/Verify** Gathering, organizing and considering of supporting evidence, including considerations of evidence quality. 	**Redirect/Park** Gently guiding conversation away from non-productive directions. **Interrupt/Refocus** Directing attention to other thematic elements.
Commitment	**Integration Consolidation Take - Aways**	**Emergent Consensus** Convergence on decisions and supporting rationales. 	**Generate Specific Examples** Creating examples that apply concepts and incorporate personal experience. 	**Create General Rules** Drawing out the general principles and developing tentative "rules of thumb". 	**Making Predictions** Considering what might happen as a result of particular idea in particular scenario. 	**Articulate limits of applicability** Considering to what degree does context affect the applicability of the idea?

The quotes where selected by the authors from a series of interview transcripts. The interviews were conducted in January 2012. The interviews were conducted so participants could share their knowledge and experience with TBL facilitation. The authors wish to thank the participants: Laura Madson, Holly Bender, Bill Roberson, Mary Gourley, Pete Ostafichuk, William Ofstad, Gail Feigenbaum, Bill Goffe.
The diagram is based on an original work by Angela Cunningham and is also inspired by the writings of Jim Erskine.

Framework for TBL Application Activity Reporting Facilitation

Loretta Whitehorne Registered Nurses Professional Development Center Larry Michaelsen Central Missouri University Jim Sibley University of British Columbia

Selling TBL to students

I think in Team Based Learning, there's more of a sales job upfront.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State

The majority of students in my experience come into class, with a history of being burned by group work. Many students are resistant to TBL. I approach this challenge by first surfacing student concerns. We develop a two column chart of pros and cons. Students always come up with a great list - slackers on my team, I did all the work and nobody else worked, we couldn't find time when everyone could meet outside of class, there were people that were too aggressive, and there were people that were too passive. Once their concerns and the benefits of team work are surfaced, I make sure to address the concerns and talk about how TBL is different; how TBL is designed to maximize the benefits and minimize the cons.

Holly Bender
Professor of Veterinary Clinical Pathology
Associate Director of the Center for Excellence in Learning and Teaching
Iowa State University

After the first couple of activities, at the end of the class, I try to save five minutes to help students realize how much they have learned and to sort of translate what they just did into what a lecture could have looked like. So that they can see that all of the information that could have been in that lecture is what came up in their conversations.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State

Selling TBL to yourself

Figuring out how to pitch the course and then managing the pushback, the resistance, and knowing in advance that the resistance is coming and there's nothing wrong with it—it takes you two or three rounds to get the point where you say, yeah, that's okay.

Bill Roberson
Faculty Member and Faculty Developer
SUNY Albany

I try to help faculty get into a playful experimental mood. Most university professors are horrified by surprises. You have to get them to the point where that's no longer an issue, that surprises are good. So when students don't want to do something and push back because they say you're not teaching us, you say--flip that--that's a compliment. You've got them where you want them. You've started to provoke what I call productive frustration. We want our students to be pushed into a point of productive frustration. That's when learning begins. Sometimes, it's an uncomfortable moment for you the teacher as well as for the students. But, learn to enjoy--learn to understand that you have provoked that intentionally. Accept the responsibility of having provoked it and enjoy that because that's your job as a teacher.

Bill Roberson
Faculty Member and Faculty Developer
SUNY Albany

Faculty need to be willing to take the risks. The lecture environment is so well controlled. We can time it to the minute of the order things are going to happen. In TBL classroom, it's a much more dynamic environment and you never know which way things are going to go, but that's not a bad thing.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

80 percent of my students like me when they walk in. They're probably going to like me when they leave. They are taking the course because they have to, they're going to try to make a good grade, and they will most likely walk away satisfied with my TBL course. And then, I've got 10 percent who just dislike me, but they would have disliked me no matter what. And then, I've got another 10 percent that really, really like me and they would feel that way no matter what.

Overall, my course evaluations have improved; the comments are the only interesting difference. The comments referring to a TBL course are often more intense than I remember when I lectured. In a course of 30 students, I will get at least 15 intensely positive comments (i.e., "The best college class I have ever had, TBL experience was awesome, more classes should be taught this way.""). I will also receive 1-2 intensely negative comments (i.e. "I did not learn anything", "I had to teach myself, I wish the teacher would have actually taught"). When I lectured, I don't remember particularly intense negative comments. I do feel like I get at least two or three scathing comments per semester that were completely related to team-based learning, but that is okay.

Mary Gourley
Instructor - Psychology
Gaston College

Giving up control and making students responsible for their own learning

It's important to get out of the students' way. When I teach other people about Team-Based Learning or even just teaching in general, one mantra that I end up repeating is make the students do it.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State

The toughest part is just not jumping in there, really turning the floor over to the students. The teams are the ones that really have to go digging and take the responsibility of learning.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

I try not to jump in. At the end, if they need some clarification, of course, I'm going to jump in. …But, I more typically play a little bit of a devil's advocate and do my best to have them explain why rather than me explaining.

Holly Bender
Professor of Veterinary Clinical Pathology
Associate Director of the Center for Excellence in Learning and Teaching
Iowa State University

I try to make it so the students are the ones that are doing most of the work and I am just there to organize, create the assignments and keep things moving forward. I'm not doing the work for them. They're doing the work.

Holly Bender
Professor of Veterinary Clinical Pathology
Associate Director of the Center for Excellence in Learning and Teaching
Iowa State University

My role as facilitator

We often describe ourselves as facilitators a little bit more--almost like judges in a law hearing. We'll make a decision based on the information that's presented to us, but we're not the ones that are going to pose the questions.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

The quotes where selected by the authors from a series of interview transcripts. The interviews were conducted in January 2012. The interviews were conducted so participants could share their knowledge and experience with TBL facilitation. The authors wish to thank the participants: Laura Madson, Holly Bender, Bill Roberson, Mary Gourley, Pete Ostafichuk, William Ofstad, Gail Feigenbaum, Bill Goffe.
The diagram is based on an original work by Angela Cunningham and is also inspired by the writings of Jim Erskine.

It's not so much the answer to the application exercise that matters, it's the thinking behind it, and talking more about why they made that decision.

Bill Goffe
Professor – Economics
SUNY Oswego

I do like to ask a few questions, but I generally like to put it back on them. Most often they have the knowledge, but they're so used to having someone else put in the pieces for them. Sometimes I'm the devil's advocate, or ask them another question just to get them to talk more.

Gail Feigenbaum
Nursing Assistant Instructor
College of New Mexico

Actively Listen

I am prepared to sit back and let them work when I've already done my work outside of the classroom. I'm not doing much talking. I don't answer a lot of questions. I just walk around and listen to them.

Mary Gourley
Instructor - Psychology
Gaston College

I'll actually sit down next to a team and just watch. To see how they're processing the question. Are they heading in the direction you would hope, and then monitor other teams and see if they're processing and thinking about the question in the way you intended? To get more tuned with students strengths and difficulties.

Bill Goffe
Professor – Economics
SUNY Oswego

You have to stay engaged even though you're just the facilitator. I make sure I'm circulating and answering questions if they arise. I learned that early on.

Mary Gourley
Instructor - Psychology
Gaston College

Recognizing a good activity

The activity basically runs itself. The students understand the activity, so they're doing what they're supposed to do. They are so engaged in their conversation with each other and the task that, literally, they don't know where I am; they don't care where I am. And my favorite days--this doesn't happen often, but my favorite days are when I have to tell them to leave.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State

Lots of noise - good on task noise. You can hear the conversations are all about the activity. There's professionalism in the way the students interact with one another.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

Watching students' body language, they really lean forward and everyone is contributing. It gets better as time goes by, as they work more in teams. Just energy! You know, you can taste it.

Gail Feigenbaum
Nursing Assistant Instructor
College of New Mexico

Importance of Planning

TBL is so preparation driven for both student and teacher. The instructor needs to be better prepared than is some other teaching methods.

William Ofstad
Assistant Professor - Clinical Sciences
Cal North State University

I try to make sure that we're clear about what the objectives are, that there's a clear summary at the end, and I point out what my observations were.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

We do it really low stakes at the beginning, and then we ramp it up as time goes on.

Holly Bender
Professor of Veterinary Clinical Pathology
Associate Director of the Center for Excellence in Learning and Teaching
Iowa State University

I think that my level of preparation is good for everyone because I get some positive comments on it in my evaluations at the end of the semester - "I liked the way that we knew what was going to happen in the class" "I liked the way that the teacher was prepared" "I liked the way the class was organized".

Mary Gourley
Instructor - Psychology
Gaston College

Clear Tasking

It is important to have your goals about what you want the students to be able to do and what are your goals for them? Have them really clear in your mind.

Gail Feigenbaum
Nursing Assistant Instructor
College of New Mexico

The more I do it, the more explicit the instructions are that I give about the actual thing they're supposed to do. There are a lot of instructions that are printed as part of the activity.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State

Importance of Closure

It's important at the end of the activity to bring it all back together, for closure or summation, and really taking all the things that have been learned and expressed by the students and kind of repackaging it. Reminding students of the things that they've gone through, what they've expressed.

Pete Ostafichuk
Instructor – Mechanical Engineering
University of British Columbia

I try to emphasize the really important stuff. I verbally do more integration with where does this fit in the big picture.

Laura Madson
Associate Professor – Psychology
New Mexico State